
Human Rights in Health

- **Good Wishes and Practical Tools !?**



UNIVERSITÉ
DE GENÈVE

FACULTÉ DE MÉDECINE
Institut de médecine
sociale et préventive

■ Our Question

- *Could Patient Satisfaction be such a practical tool ??*

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Right to health indicators: the debate

- Former special UN Rapporteur on the Right to Health
 - proposed 72 human rights indicators
 - applied to the health sectors
- that can/could/should be monitored in each state

*Backman G, Hunt P & al. Health systems and the right to health:
an assessment of 194 countries. The Lancet 2008; 372:2047-85*

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Right to health indicators: the debate

- E.G. to show the extent of expected monitoring by Hunt &co:
 - infant mortality rates,
 - percentage of 1-year-old children immunized against major infant diseases,
 - maternal mortality ratio,
 - prevalence rate of violence against women,
 - percentage of the population (urban and rural) having access to drinking water,
 - existing national health workforce strategy,
 - proportion of national health budget allocated to mental health,
 - health data protection laws,
 - protection of freedom of expression by the constitution,
 - number of ratified international human rights treaties,
 - etc

*Backman G, Hunt P &al. Health systems and the right to health:
an assessment of 194 countries. The Lancet 2008; 372:2047-85*

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Right to health indicators: the debate

- Critical voices have underlined that
 - 18/72 (25%) proposed indicators are not monitored by any of the 194 states
 - even basic indicators such as maternal mortality ratio are monitored by less than 50% of the states

*Smith R On the right to health. BMJ
Group Blogs, 15 décembre 2008.*

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Right to health indicators: the debate

- Critical voices have underlined that
 - the ratification of an international human-rights treaty is no guarantee to the implementation of the right to health

Palmer A, Tomkinson J & al. Does ratification of human rights treaties effects on population health. The Lancet 2009; 373(9679):1987-1992



- Again our Question
 - *Could Patient Satisfaction be a practical tool for monitoring the right to health..... health care??*



UNIVERSITÉ
DE GENÈVE

FACULTÉ DE MÉDECINE
Institut de médecine
sociale et préventive

Patient Satisfaction

■ A Right to Health Indicator?

Emmanuel Kabengele, Philippe Chastonay

Faculty of Medicine, University of Geneva

Swiss School of Public Health, Zurich

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Some thoughts about Patient Satisfaction

- **An evolutive concept**
 - the degree of convergence between the expectations the patients have of ideal care and their perception of the care they really get *Risser NL.. Nursing research 1975*
 - the expression of patient's judgment on the quality of care received in all aspects , especially the interpersonal process *Donabedian A JAMA 1988*
 - an indicator of the quality of care and integrates in its definition the patients' experiences as an key-element of (un)satisfaction: the voice of patient
Wolosin R.J. Q Manage Health Care. 2005
 - the degree to which nursing care as well as public health activities meet patients' expectations in terms of art of care, technical quality, physical environment, availability and continuity/efficacy /outcomes
Mrayyan M T International Nursing Review 2006

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Some thoughts about the Right to health

- According to the General Comment 14 /2000 the basic constituents of the Right to health are:
 - **Availability** of health services, health infrastructure and public health programs
 - **Non-discriminatory access** (physical, economic, information) for all to health care and prevention programs,
 - **Acceptability** (ethical, gender-related, cultural) of health services and public health programs,
 - **Quality of care**, i.e. health procedures and programs must be scientifically and medically sound which in turn implies
 - competent health professionals, adequate medication and appropriate infrastructure.

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Now our approach (1)

- Methodological approach
 - Identification, clarification, classification, comparison of key-concepts of the right to health
 - As defined in the GC 14/2000
 - Applied to a selected set of surveys/reviews on patient satisfaction
 - Through the concept analysis based on the model developed by Rodgers

Rogers BL Concept, analysis and the development of knowledge: the evolutionary cycle .J Adv Nursing 1989;14(4):330-335

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Now our approach (2)

- Selection of a set of surveys/reviews on patient satisfaction
 - Citation frequency by Scholar Google
 - Set 1: globally
 - Set 2: in specific clinical settings
 - Set 3: in specific cultural settings
 - Set 4: in specific pathologies

Kabengele E, Chastonay P

Patient satisfaction: a right to health indicator? Submitted Health Policy, 2010

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "globally"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
I. Hall JA, Dornan MC 1988 (n: 308)	What patients like about their medical care and how often they asked: a meta analysis of the satisfaction literature. <i>Soc Sci Med</i> 1988;27:935-9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Humanity - Information - Global quality - Competency - Administration - Access - Costs - Infrastructure - Results - Continuity of care - Psycho-social attention 	

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "globally"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the Right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
I. Hall JA, Dornan MC 1988 (n: 308)	What patients like about their medical care and how often they asked: a meta analysis of the satisfaction literature. <i>Soc Sci Med</i> 1988;27:935-9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Humanity - Information - Global quality - Competency - Administration - Access - Costs - Infrastructure - Results - Continuity of care - Psycho-social attention 	<p>Quality of care (professional competencies) Accessibility (information) Quality of care (scientific and medical) Quality of care (professional competencies) / Availability (installations, services, programs, personal) Accessibility (financial) Quality of care (availability of infrastructure) Quality of care (scientific and medical) Quality of care (scientific and medical) Acceptability (cultural)</p>

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "globally"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
II.Risser N. 1975 (n: 168)	Development of an instrument to measure patient satisfaction with nurses and nursing care in primary care settings. <i>Nursing Research</i> 1975;24:45-52	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cost - Convenience - Providers' personal qualities - Interpersonal relationship - Provider's competence - Quality of care 	

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: “globally”

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
II.Risser N. 1975 (n: 168)	Development of an instrument to measure patient satisfaction with nurses and nursing care in primary care settings. <i>Nursing Research</i> 1975;24:45-52	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cost - Convenience - Providers' personal qualities - Interpersonal relationship - Provider's competence - Quality of care 	<p>Accessibility (financial) Accessibility (physical)</p> <p>Acceptability (cultural) Acceptability (cultural, gender-related)</p> <p>Quality of care (professional competencies) Quality of care (scientific and medical)</p>

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific clinical setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
IV. Mahon Y P 1996 (n:76)	An analysis of the concept » patient satisfaction » as it relates to contemporary <u>nursing care</u> . <i>Journal of Advanced Nursing</i> 1996; 24:1241-1248	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Art of care/ humaneness; - Technical quality of care - Competence/ proficiency - Access /convenience - Finances / costs - Environment/ organization - Availability of providers - Continuity of care - Efficacy / outcomes 	

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific clinical setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
IV. Mahon Y P 1996 (n:76)	An analysis of the concept » patient satisfaction » as it relates to contemporary <u>nursing care</u> . <i>Journal of Advanced Nursing</i> 1996; 24:1241-1248	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Art of care/ humaneness; - Technical quality of care - Competence/ proficiency - Access /convenience - Finances / costs - Environment/ organization - Availability of providers - Continuity of care - Efficacy / outcomes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of care (professional competencies) Quality of care (availability of material) Quality of care (professional competencies) Accessibility (physical) Accessibility (financial) Quality of care (availability of infrastructure) Availability (installations, services, programs) Quality of care (scientific and medical) Quality of care (scientific and medical)

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific clinical setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
III. Baker R. 1991 (n: 57)	The reliability and criterion validity of a measure of patients' satisfaction with their <u>general practice</u> . <i>Fam Practice</i> .1991;8:171-77	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Continuity of care - Accessibility to surgery - Quality of medical care - Availability of doctors 	

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific clinical setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
III. Baker R. 1991 (n: 57)	The reliability and criterion validity of a measure of patients' satisfaction with their <u>general practice</u> . <i>Fam Practice</i> .1991;8:171-77	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Continuity of care - Accessibility to surgery - Quality of medical care - Availability of doctors 	<p>Quality of care (scientific and medical)</p> <p>Availability (installations, services, programs, personal)</p> <p>Quality of care (scientific and medical)</p> <p>Availability (installations, services, programs, personal)</p>

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific cultural setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
VII. Phattarayuttawat S, Ngamthipwatthana T 2005 (/)	The development of the <u>Thai psychiatric satisfaction scale</u> . <i>J Med Assoc Thai</i> 2005; 88(8):1067-76	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Professionals skills/behaviours - Information - Access - Efficacy - Types of intervention - Relative involvement - Environment and settings 	

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific cultural setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
VII. Phattarayuttawat S, Ngamthipwatthana T 2005 (/)	The development of the <u>Thai psychiatric satisfaction scale</u> . <i>J Med Assoc Thai</i> 2005; 88(8):1067-76	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Professionals skills/behaviours - Information - Access - Efficacy - Types of intervention - Relative involvement - Environment and settings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of care (professional competencies) Accessibility (information) Availability (installations, services, programs, personal) Quality of care (scientific and medical) Availability (installations, services, programs) Acceptability (cultural) Quality of care (availability of infrastructure & material)

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific cultural setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
VIII. Cockcroft A, Anderson N & al. 2007 (n:6)	What did the public think of health services reform in <u>Bangladesh</u> ? Three national community-based surveys 1993-2003. <i>BMC Health Research Policy and Systems</i> . 2007;5:1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Unmet need for healthcare - Waiting time - Payments - Availability of medicines -Explanation of condition -Satisfaction with provider 	

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Excerpts of Results: "specific cultural setting"

Author (n citations reported in Scholar Google)	Study/review	Fields of Patient satisfaction (key-concepts)	Expressed Domains of the right to Health in the General Comment 14/2000 related to patient satisfaction items
VIII. Cockcroft A, Anderson N & al. 2007 (n:6)	What did the public think of health services reform in Bangladesh? Three national community-based surveys 1993-2003. <i>BMC Health Research Policy and Systems</i> . 2007;5:1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Unmet need for healthcare -Waiting time - Payments - Availability of medicines - Explanation of condition - Satisfaction with provider 	<p>Availability (installations, services, programs, personal) Accessibility (physical, cultural), Acceptability</p> <p>Accessibility (financial) Quality of care (availability of material)</p> <p>Accessibility (information) Quality of care (professional competencies)</p>

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Some remarks (1)

- Perhaps one should consider integrating patient satisfaction concepts into the right to health indicator arsenal

- All the more
 - From a political point of view,
 - listening to the opinion of patients is a democratic necessity and in accordance with the concept of participation which is a central feature to the harmonious functioning of modern societies

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Some remarks (2)

- Perhaps one should consider integrating patient satisfaction concepts into the right to health indicator arsenal

- All the more
 - From a sociological point of view,
 - integrating the opinion of patients into the therapeutic strategy strengthens the partnership dimension of care, weakening the obsolete paternalistic approach, formerly a paramount feature of the therapeutic relationship

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Some remarks (3)

- Perhaps one should consider integrating patient satisfaction concepts into the right to health indicator arsenal

- All the more
 - From a legal point of view
 - in many states PS studies have become a legal obligation
 - in France it is a priority since 1996
Revilla A, Taboulet P & al. Urgence Pratique 2008 ; 90 :5-8
 - in Great Britain it has been high on the agenda ever since in the 80ies
Stizia J, Wood N Soc Sci Med 1997; 45(12): 1829-1843
 - in the USA it has been identified as a key issue of the 21 century
IOM- Committee on quality of care in America. National Academy Press. Washington 2001

Patient Satisfaction: a right to health indicator?

Concluding remark

- Patient satisfaction might be a convenient indicator allowing to tackle human rights violations in the health sector (early warning system?) :
 - Though lacking objectivity, since satisfaction is by definition subjective even when it is based on an precise checklist
 - it does represent the “voice of patient”
 - it reflects the patients experience with or his perception of the health system

Wolosin R.J. Q Manage Health Care. 2005; 14(3):155-164
Mrayyan M T. International Nursing Review 2006; 53:224-230
Fitzpatrick R. BMJ 1991; 302: 887-889, 1129-1132



- Could Patient Satisfaction be a Practical Tool for monitoring the right to health..... health care??
- *In our view the Question is relevant!*